BROOMHILL ACTION AND NEIGHBOURHOOD GROUP

Town and Country Planning Act 1990 Appeals by Miller Homes Ltd and Escafeld Estates Ltd

Land at Crookes Road and Taptonville Road, Sheffield S10 2AZ

Planning applications: 05/03130/FUL and 07/01379/CAC

Appeal numbers: APP/J4423/E/08/2061372/NWF and APP/J4423/A/08/2061375/NWF

Proof of Evidence by Broomhill Action and Neighbourhood Group (BANG)

Broomhill Action and Neighbourhood Group Hon Secretary: Mark Pickering Ash Lawns, 88 Ashdell Road, Sheffield, South Yorkshire, S10 3DB Tel: 0114 266 4668 (work) E-mail: secretary@thebang.org.uk

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	3
The Applications Site Characteristics	
Section 1: Site History and context	5
Composition of the site Synopsis of the History of Tapton Elms and Taptonville Road Section 1 Figures	6
Section 2: Loss of prominent trees and historic landscape features	11
Section 2 Figures	14
Section 3: Impact of the planned redevelopment scheme on Taptonville Ro	ad17
Section 3 Figures	21
Section 4 - Unsatisfactory design for the northern part of the site	26
Section 4 Figures:	28
Section 5: Ecology and protected species	30
Procedural failings Protected species on the site	
Section 6: Biodiversity and nature conservation	35
Biodiversity value of the site Local site designation UDP and SDF policies on the Green Environment Section 6 Figures	37 39
Section 7: Historic Gardens within the site	44
Section 8: Developments in Local Open Space	46
Section 8 Figures:	49
List of attachments	50
Attachment 1: Sheffield Conservation Advisory Group minutes Attachment 2: Sheffield Urban Design Review Panel Attachment 3: Sheffield University Press Release Attachment 4: Botanic Gardens open day leaflet	52 54

Introduction

The Broomhill Action and Neighbourhood Group was formed in 1973 and is a local community group, governed by a written constitution. Membership of BANG is open to all who live or work in Broomhill. The aims of BANG are:

- To promote high standards of planning and architecture in Broomhill;
- To educate the public on the geography, history, natural history and architecture of Broomhill
- To secure the preservation, protection, development and improvement of features of historic or public interest in Broomhill.

The Applications

The applications are for Conservation Area Consent for the demolition of existing student halls of residence, annexes and associated buildings including temporary structures around Experimental Gardens and at 26, 28 and 30 Taptonville Road; and for planning permission for the erection of 69 apartments and 48 houses, conversion of Hadow House and coach house to ten flats, plus associated parking. The proposed new-build houses and apartments would be split into two groups; a large group of houses and apartments on the northern part of the site, and a smaller group of 22 houses on the southern part of the site. The development plans have undergone many revisions, the latest (Revision f) having been produced recently – April 2008. Revision d was the version on which the last major round of community consultation was conducted during 2007 and Revision e, produced only days before the LPA planning board meeting in October 2007, was refused permission by the LPA.

While BANG has no general objection to the redevelopment of the northern part of the site, we do object to some aspects of the scheme for that part as currently proposed by the appellants. The main thrust of our evidence however relates the development of the southern part of the site. BANG is strongly opposed to *any* building within this area and will present detailed arguments opposing the appellants' case in respect of this part.

Site Characteristics

The site is trapezoidal, bounded to the north by Crookes Road, to the west by Hallamgate Road, to the south-west by Taptonville Road, to the south by Taptonville Crescent, and to the east by the gardens of residential houses on Crookes Road and by Pisgah House (owned by Sheffield University) and Etruria House (a hotel), both listed buildings. The site slopes towards both the south and the east, with Tapton Elms (i.e. Hadow House) situated at the highest point. The boundary walls of the site to the south and the east both mark significant changes of level, being less than 1 metre high from within the site, but approximately 2.5 - 3.5 metres high from outside the site. This level change has a major impact on views into the site from the surroundings. The entire site lies within the Broomhill Conservation Area.

Section 1: Site History and context

Composition of the site

The site is a composite of four different sub-sites, adjacent parcels of land acquired by the University of Sheffield from different previous owners at different times, hence with diverse histories and usages. A diagram is included at Figure 1.1.

The northern part of the site (part A) houses the Tapton Hall of Residence, constructed in 1969 on the site of Hallamgate House, an eighteenth century country house whose formal garden was bounded to the south and east by a Ha-ha, the southern part of which is still standing. This land was acquired by Sheffield University in 1963, Hallamgate House demolished, and Tapton Hall built in its place. The hall of residence opened in 1969.

The western part of the site (part B) is occupied by Tapton Elms (now called Hadow House), a Victorian mansion built in 1853 at the head of Taptonville Road together with its lodge house and coach house. To the south of Tapton Elms, running along Taptonville Road, are the original gardens of Tapton Elms, which are separated by high retaining walls into two distinct areas stepping down the sloping landscape. The ornamental garden area closest to the house (site B1) was built upon circa 1977 and houses two two-storey student residence blocks. The walled kitchen garden of Tapton Elms (site B2) at the south-western end of the site, ~0.2 Ha, is an enclosed space whose high stone walls form a linking landscape design element between Tapton Elms and Taptonville Crescent. Tapton Elms and its gardens was acquired by Sheffield University in 1921.

The University's Botanic Garden (part C), ~0.6 Ha, was established in 1951 on a triangular parcel of undeveloped land at the centre of the site. This parcel of land was acquired by the University in 1944.

The two principal garden areas (parts B2 and C) are collectively referred to as the 'Experimental Gardens'. These areas have never been developed and only house temporary structures, permissions for the retention of which have had to be periodically renewed. Outline planning permission for permanent development of this

site was refused in the early 1980's on environmental grounds. Most of the temporary structures are situated within the walled garden (Site B2).

The final distinct element of this site is Pisgah House, a listed building of local historical importance dating from the 1820's whose large, enclosed garden is connected to the Botanic Garden via an open arched entrance. Pisgah House is not part of the appeal scheme, although its setting is affected by it.

Synopsis of the History of Tapton Elms and Taptonville Road

Taptonville Road, which is one of the principal character areas within the Broomhill Conservation Area, was planned and developed in its entirety by John Hobson, a successful scissor manufacturer and as such an exponent of one of Sheffield's classic trades - the manufacture of edge tools. John Hobson bought the row of fields that then stretched from Hallamgate Road south to Glossop Road, and through the centre of these fields he laid out Taptonville Road and Taptonville Crescent. Hobson's own family home, Tapton Elms, and its lodge, coach house and gardens were sited on the prime plot at the top of the east side of the road, where the house's principal rooms had views over Sheffield to the east and open views of the Porter Valley to the south. The house is described in the Pevsner Guide to Sheffield¹ as 'neo-Tudor' in style.

The gardens to the south of the house and the falling land ensured that the vistas from Tapton Elms were unimpeded by the houses in the Crescent further down Taptonville Road. On both sides of the road, large plots were laid out and developed over a period of ~15 years with fine houses in a range of styles typical of the period, but with local refinements peculiar to Sheffield house builders. Many of these houses were occupied by relatives of the Hobson family. All of these original houses on Taptonville Road and Crescent survive and several of them are now Grade II listed by English Heritage. The entire street is a rare example in Sheffield of a designed streetscape and its 'outstanding historic ambience' is recognised as a conservation priority in the recent Conservation Area Appraisal² commissioned by the Council.

¹ Pevsner Architectural Guides: Sheffield. John Minnis and Ruth Harman, 2004. ISBN 0-300-10585-1.

² Broomhill Conservation Area Appraisal report, 2007.

Tapton Elms itself was completed by John Hobson in 1853 and occupied by his family, which was increasingly prominent in Sheffield life. Following John Hobson's death in 1889 his second son, Albert, lived there. He was at various times Lord Mayor, Master Cutler and a pro-vice-chancellor of the newly-formed University. He held many other public offices and was knighted. Tapton Elms and its gardens was acquired by Sheffield University when it was sold in 1920, a short while before Albert Hobson's own death 1923. Both of Albert Hobson's sons had been killed in WW1.

The house and associated buildings were used for the next thirty years as a hall of residence, including for a period during World War 2, evacuee students from London. There followed a period of use by the University's Officer Training Corps and finally, from 1971 to the present, usage by the Music Department.

Extracts from local maps showing the site and its context before and after the construction of Taptonville Road (in 1849 and 1905), and at present (from the Conservation Area Map), are shown in Figures 1.2, 1.3 and 1.4. A detailed historical analysis of the site and surrounding landscape is given in Joan Sewell's evidence.

Section 1 Figures

Figure 1.1: Diagram of the site showing its different component parcels of land.

A: Tapton Halls of Residence, built on the site of Hallam Gate House

B: Tapton Elms (renamed Hadow House), together with its coach house and lodge

B1: Former ornamental garden of Tapton Elms, now housing two 2-storey residence blocks

B2: Former walled kitchen garden of Tapton Elms

C: Botanic Garden

The black dashed line is the current boundary of the Experimental Gardens







Figure 1.4 Site and its surroundings as shown in the Broomhill Conservation Area map, 2007.